Soft Matter



View Article Online View Journal | View Issue

Check for updates

Cite this: Soft Matter, 2022, 18, 6511

Received 27th May 2022, Accepted 17th August 2022

DOI: 10.1039/d2sm00698g

rsc.li/soft-matter-journal

Relative effects of polymer composition and sample preparation on glass dynamics[†]

Robert M. Elder, ‡*^b Amanda L. Forster, ^a Ajay Krishnamurthy, ^a Joseph M. Dennis, ^b Hiroshi Akiba, ^c Osamu Yamamuro, ^c Kanae Ito, ^d Katherine M. Evans, ^e Christopher Soles^e and Timothy W. Sirk ^b *^b

Modern design of common adhesives, composites and polymeric parts makes use of polymer glasses that are stiff enough to maintain their shape under a high stress while still having a ductile behavior after the yield point. Typically, material compositions are tuned with co-monomers, polymer blends, plasticizers, or other additives to arrive at a tradeoff between the elastic modulus and toughness. In contrast, strong changes to the mechanics of a glass are possible by changing only the molecular packing during vitrification or even deep in the glassy state. For example, physical aging or processing techniques such as physical vapor deposition increase the density, embrittle the material, and increase elastic modulus. Here, we use molecular simulations, validated by positron annihilation lifetime spectroscopy (PALS) and quasi-elastic neutron scattering, to understand the free volume distribution and the resulting dynamics of glassy co-polymers where the composition is systemically varied between polar 5-norbornene-2-methanol (NBOH) and non-polar ethylidene norbornene (ENB) monomers. In these polymer glasses, we analyze the structural features of the unoccupied volume using clustering analysis, where the clustering is parameterized to reproduce experimental measurements of the same features from PALS. Further, we analyze the dynamics, quantified by the Debye-Waller factor, and compare the results with softer, lower density states. Our findings indicate that faster structural relaxations and potentially improved ductility are possible through changes to the geometric structure and fraction of the free volume, and that the resulting changes to the glass dynamics are comparable to large changes in the monomer composition.

In this work, we use molecular simulations and experiments to examine the relationship of the molecular packing, as quantified by size and shapes of voids ("holes"), with the dynamics of polar and non-polar polymer glasses. In particular, we compare the relative effect of the glass structure, which is controlled by material processing, with the choice of monomer composition. Polymer chemistries based on 5-norbornene-2-methanol (NBOH) and a related monomer, ethylidene norbornene (ENB) were considered. NBOH contains a polar hydroxy group capable of hydrogen bonding, whereas ENB is entirely non-polar. The level of polar chemistry was systematically varied by adjusting the number of NBOH and ENB monomers in the chains; The most polar chemistry is pure NBOH (termed 0% ENB), while the least polar is pure ENB (termed 100% ENB). Intermediate polarities are represented by ENB-co-NBOH copolymers termed 25, 50, and 75% ENB to denote the ENB fraction. In the simulations, each polymer chain contains a fixed number of 20 ENB or NBOH monomers, resulting in a chain molecular mass that is approximately constant. Likewise, the chains have similar flexibility, an important factor for nanovoids,^{1,2} which we verified by calculating the backbone orientational correlation and the persistence length. These compositions and their properties are summarized in Table 1. Molecular structures were created above the glass transition temperature (T_g) , equilibrated, and quenched into the glassy state at 300 K at a quench rate of 10^{11} , 10^{12} , or 10^{13} K s⁻¹, along with another set of structures, nominally labeled 10^0 K s⁻¹, that were generated at the experimental density. As discussed

^a Materials Measurement Science Division, National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, Maryland 20899, USA

^b Polymers Branch, U.S. DEVCOM Army Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Ground, Maryland 21005, USA. E-mail: timothy.w.sirk.civ@army.mil

^c Institute for Solid State Physics, University of Tokyo, Kashiwa, Chiba, 277-8581, Japan

^d Industrial Application Division, Spring-8, Japan Synchrotron Radiation Research Institute (JASRI), 1-1-1 Kouto, Sayo, Hyogo 679-5198, Japan

^e Materials Science and Engineering Division, National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, Maryland 20899, USA

[†] Electronic supplementary information (ESI) available: Additional details and data for molecular simulations and experiments. See DOI: https://doi.org/10.1039/ d2sm00698g

[‡] Current address: Center for Devices and Radiological Health, U.S. Food and Drug Administration, Silver Spring, Maryland 20903, USA. E-mail: robert.elder@fda.hhs.gov

Table 1 Summary of compositions ($\phi_{\rm ENB}$) and properties used to match simulations with PALS data. Each composition contains $N_{\rm NB}$ NBOH monomers and $N_{\rm ENB}$ ENB monomers per chain with exactly 136 000 total atoms at inverse mass density \hat{v} . The polarity and Debye–Waller factor $\langle u^2 \rangle$ are taken from the normalized octanol–water partition coefficient and mean square displacements, respectively, as detailed in the ESI

$\phi_{ m enb}$	$N_{\rm ENB}$	$N_{\rm NB}$	$\hat{\nu}$, cm ³ g ⁻¹	$\langle u^2 \rangle$, Å ²	Polarity, nm ⁻²
0	0	20	0.916	0.48	0.29
25	5	15	0.945	0.57	0.28
50	10	10	0.974	0.66	0.25
75	15	5	1.003	0.75	0.21
100	20	0	1.038	0.85	0.16

below, the density changes that are introduced by varying the quench rate greatly effect the local molecular dynamics, as density is a strong indicator of glass dynamics such as the Debye–Waller factor.^{3,4} Further simulation details and analysis are given in the ESI.[†]

Experimental samples of the same compositions were synthesized as described in prior work,⁵ followed by analysis with positron annihilation lifetime spectroscopy (PALS) and guasielastic neutron scattering (QENS). PALS uses positrons to probe spatial packing deficiencies or density heterogeneities in the material at the sub-nanometer scale. While the voids identified by PALS are sometimes referred to as "free volume", they can either be static (as in a zeolite) or dynamic (as in a liquid) in nature. In polymers, voids usually consist of both static and dynamic packing defects.⁶ The positron source, a radioactive salt, is placed between two pieces of the material of interest so that positrons are injected into the material. These injected positrons eventually thermalize and pick up a free electron to form the positronium bound state. The electron-positron pair is a neutral bound state, with a diameter comparable to an H atom. The parallel-spin triplet state, known as ortho-positronium (o-Ps) is long lived with a 142 ns lifetime in a vacuum. However, in polymers the neutral *o*-Ps lifetime (τ_3) is cut short by the pick-off annihilation mechanism, typically on the order of 1 to 10 ns. As o-Ps is a neutral species, it minimizes interactions with the material and localizes in low density regions of the sample. Empirical calibrations with zeolites and other controlled-pore solids are used to correlate τ_3 with hole size. The positron hole size is typically

calculated using the semi-empirical Tau–Eldrup equation, $\tau_3 =$

 $\frac{1}{2}[1 - R/(R + 0.166) + \sin(2\pi R/(R + 0.166))/2\pi]^{-1}$ with corresponding hole (void) volume $\langle V_v \rangle = (4/3)\pi R^{3.7}$ Further details are given elsewhere.⁸ The mean-square displacements (MSD) for compositions $\phi_{\text{ENB}} = 0$, 50 and 100 were quantified using the elastic intensities from quasi-elastic neutron scattering (QENS) measurements, performed on the Angle Focusing Cold Neutron Spectrometer⁹ (AGNES) installed by the Institute for Solid State Physics, University of Tokyo, at Japanese Research Reactor 3 (JRR-3), Japan Atomic Energy Agency (JAEA), in Tokai, Japan. Measurements of the MSD represent a time range spanning approximately 10 ps for a series of temperatures, including 300 K. Details are given in the ESI.[†]

Parameterization of simulated voids with PALS data

Voids were identified from molecular structures as follows: (1) unoccupied volume was found by overlaying a cubic grid on the atomic coordinates (0.5 Å grid resolution); any grid points overlapping an atomic van der Waals radius were taken as occupied voxels. The remaining unoccupied grid points (i.e., empty voxels) were further processed in the following step. (2) Voids were identified as large contiguous groups of empty voxels using the Density-Based Spatial Clustering of Applications with Noise (DBSCAN) algorithm.^{10,11} DBSCAN identifies discrete regions of high density (clusters) and regions of low density (outliers); empty voxels were characterized in this way as belonging to either larger and more consolidated "void spaces" (clusters) or small "interstitial spaces" (outliers). The density metric is defined through two parameters, which are the neighborhood radius ε and the minimum number of neighborhood points M. A simple demonstration of the algorithm for a two-dimensional cartoon is given in Fig. 1. In molecular simulations, we selected a single set of parameters, $\varepsilon = 2.58$ Å and M = 260, by matching



Fig. 1 A two-dimensional cartoon of the void identification algorithm acting on a single snapshot. A grid is superimposed on the atomic coordinates (not shown); occupied grid points (small gray circles) are discarded; unoccupied points (large circles) are analyzed by a clustering algorithm. Points with at least *M* neighbors within a radius *e* are 'core points' (color circles with black dots) with M = 4 and e = 1.1 taken for this example. The dashed black circle shows the neighborhood of one core point. Neighboring core points are assigned to the same cluster, along with their neighbors, which may have fewer than *M* neighbors (no black dots). Outliers (large gray circles) are points that do not belong to any cluster. This algorithm can recognize irregular geometries and account for periodic boundaries (orange cluster 2). In the main text, clusters of unoccupied space are termed 'voids' while the outliers are termed 'interstitial' spaces.

the average void volume from 5 replica simulations taken at the experimental mass densities with the PALS hole volume, where only the simulation data for $\phi_{\rm ENB} = 0$ was considered. Examples of individual voids are given in Fig. 2a. As shown in Fig. 2b, excellent agreement is obtained between the PALS data and simulations across all five of the compositions using a single set of parameters derived from $\phi_{\rm ENB} = 0$.

We note that previous comparisons of simulations with PALS hole volumes suggest that a minimum void size should be imposed on the MD data.¹² A likely reason is that small voids in static MD snapshots are dynamically filled more rapidly than the time-scale τ_3 of a PALS measurement, and therefore cannot contribute to the PALS hole volume. Our approach using clustering analysis introduces an approximate, though not absolute, minimum size for cavities through the minimum number of neighbors *M*. Using the parameters above, the minimum cavity size is the product of M = 260 and the voxel volume (0.5 Å³), corresponding to a void volume of 32.5 Å³. Voids of the minimum size as well as a handful of smaller voids, ~10-20 per structure, appear due to the ESI†).§

Discussion

Below $T_{\rm g}$, differences in the free volume develop due to either the chemical composition or external influences such as the quench rate, confinement effects, or perturbations that prevent packing. Thus, both compositional changes and processing are possible routes to tailor the rheology and mechanics for specific needs. Intuitively, either of these changes would be expected to strongly alter the mechanics below T_{α} through changes to the character of segmental relaxations, such as the spatial extent of rearrangements in non-linear mechanics. Indeed, the literature shows that the yield and toughness of model thermoplastics are tunable through acceleration or damping of the segmental dynamics,¹⁶ where increased segmental motion has been linked with the collapse of voids that would otherwise initiate crazing.¹⁷ For example, in recent work Soles et al. measured the MSD of polycarbonate materials with QENS, showing that the Debye-Waller $\langle u^2 \rangle$ factor, as well as slower diffusive modes, are correlated with material toughness.^{18,19} However, the segmental dynamics and resulting material properties cannot be simply reduced to functions of only the free volume, as it is widely understood that moving along an isochoric (constant volume) path by varying pressure and temperature does not, in general, preserve the dynamics. Therefore, relationships that link composition and processing to dynamics are particularly relevant since these invoke different challenges in material design. Strong compositional changes can undermine the compatibility of the polymer matrix with fillers, fibers, sheets, and their sizing packages in composite materials, whereas changes to the glass packing with processing can be expected to introduce new relaxations and potentially accelerate ageing, densification, and embrittlement. These effects have been demonstrated by altering the density²⁰



Fig. 2 (a) Representative snapshots of voids (colored shapes) in ENB and NBOH. The atoms and interstitial spaces are not shown. (b) The average volume of individual voids $\langle V_v \rangle$ vs. quench rate \dot{q} and composition ϕ_{ENB} for simulations and as found from PALS experiments. Inset: Monomer chemistries studied in this work.

of polymeric glasses such as in physical vapor deposition²¹ and pulsed laser ablation.²²

The full structural relaxation of a glass cannot be measured with explicit molecular simulations due to the mismatch of the physical timescale with molecular dynamics. We leverage localization models that allow an estimate of the glass structural relaxation time τ to be constructed from the relatively small lengths and brief dynamics available to simulations. Such models capture the emergent behavior of time- and spatially-extended relaxations from the faster cage-rattling motions. An early prediction of a relaxation time from the 'free volume' $\nu_{\rm f}$ available for molecular motion was proposed by Turnbull and Cohen²³ for glass formers near the glass transition as $log(\tau/\tau_0) = \nu_0/\nu_f$. As described below, we leverage this expression well below the $T_{\rm g}$, nominally in the range of $T/T_g \approx 0.77$; example data for $T > T_g$ is given for comparison in the ESI[†] (Fig. S6). Separately, in glassy materials, τ was linked with Debye–Waller factor $\langle u^2 \rangle$ by Hall and Wolynes,²⁴ therefore implying a relation between $\langle u^2 \rangle$ with ν_f . Dimensional analysis arguments^{25,26} indicate that Debye-Waller factor is proportional to spherical free volume cavities as $v_{\rm f} \sim \langle u^2 \rangle^{3/2}$. More generally, Simmons et al. have shown a proportional relation can be expected to hold provided that the structural features of the free volume, such as the population of free volume shapes, is preserved.²⁶ For non-spherical shapes, the proportionality becomes

$$\nu_{\rm f} \sim \langle u^2 \rangle^{\alpha/2},$$
(1)



Fig. 3 Overview of volumetric and dynamical properties from MD simulations. (a) Specific volume \hat{v} and temperature *T* diagram at each cooling rate \dot{q} for a representative composition of $\phi_{\text{ENB}} = 0.5$. Dashed lines: $\hat{v}-T$ relation in the low-rate limit as reconstructed using the limiting glass and rubber $\hat{v}-T$ slopes with the experimental density at 300 K (solid circle). (b) $\hat{v}-\dot{q}$ for each composition ϕ_{ENB} at 300 K. (c) The ratio of vold volume to total volume v_v/v_0 for \dot{q} and ϕ_{ENB} at 300 K. Solid lines: fits to a time-temperature superposition of the form $v_v(\dot{q}) = A + B(-c_2\log(\dot{q}_0/\dot{q})/(c_1 + \log(\dot{q}_0/\dot{q})))$ with *A* and *B* as free parameters, $\dot{q}_0 = 10^0$ K s⁻¹, and $c_1 = 15$ and $c_2 = 50$. (d) The mean-square displacement of atoms $\langle \Delta r^2 \rangle$ over time *t* and composition ϕ_{ENB} for a representative cooling rate ($\dot{q} = 10^0$ K s⁻¹) at 300 K. The Debye–Waller factor $\langle u^2 \rangle$ in the simulations is taken as $\langle \Delta r^2 (t = 1 \text{ ps}) \rangle$.^{13–15} Values of $\langle u^2 \rangle$ from neutron scattering experiments with $\phi_{\text{ENB}} = 0.0$, 0.5, and 1.0 are shown for comparison (dashed lines). (e) Atomic mean-square displacement $\langle \Delta r^2 \rangle$ vs. time *t* and cooling rate \dot{q} for a representative composition ($\phi_{\text{ENB}} = 0.5$) at 300 K. (f) The Debye–Waller factor vs. void fraction at 300 K given as a log–log plot. Dashed lines: fits to a power law given in eqn (1); solid black lines indicate limiting slopes of $\alpha = 3$ (upper black line) and $\alpha = 1$ (lower black line); an intersection point (large solid circle) is assumed for large v_v/v_0 .

where α is in the range 1 to 3, corresponding to cylindrical tunnels and spherical cavities, respectively.²⁶ From the above, a compact localization model that accounts for the structure of the free volume can be written as $\tau = \tau_0 \exp[(u_0^2/\langle u^2 \rangle)^{\alpha/2}]$. With this in mind, we probe the structural relaxation of ENB-NBOH polymers using the Debye-Waller factor as a proxy. (We note that τ can be directly found by estimating the parameters τ_0 and u_0^2 though analysis of $\langle u^2(T) \rangle$ for each composition.¹⁴ τ_0 and u_0^2 are treated as constants over the composition range given here.) Molecular simulations were carried out to characterize the specific volume, void volume, and fast dynamics as a function of the fraction of non-polar monomers and quench rate. These results are summarized in Fig. 3. From Fig. 3a and b, it is clear that either increasing the quench rate or increasing the fraction of non-polar ENB monomers expands the volume. Similarly, Fig. 3c shows that the fractional volume of voids, as analyzed from clustering analysis, increases with ENB fraction and quench rate. As expected, the Debye-Waller factor and overall MSD increase with ENB fraction and with quench rate, as given in Fig. 3d and e. Further, the trend of increasing $\langle u^2
angle$ with $\phi_{
m ENB}$

is confirmed by QENS measurements, with excellent numerical agreement observed for $\phi_{\rm ENB}$ = 0 and 0.5. (Additional MSD data and analysis details for simulations and QENS are given in Fig. S3 and S5–S9 of the ESI.†)

We now compare the void volumes with the Debye-Waller factor. From Fig. 3f, it is clear that the four glass preparations examined here have different relationships between the dynamics and void volume, which we take here as a stand in for the free volume. A numerical fit of $\langle u^2 \rangle$ for each quench to eqn (1) indicates values of α in the range 1.7–3.0, with the relatively slow quenched systems having lower values that suggest spherical-like cavities whereas the fast quenches have higher values. Interestingly, the free volume of the polymer compositions are significantly overlapping, with many of the polar compositions formed at fast quench rates having values similar to less polar compositions at slower quenches. Despite these similarities, the Debye-Waller factor of the fast quench systems does not increase as rapidly as would be expected with changes to the ENB composition. In general, the data indicate that similar free volumes do not give similar Debye-Waller



Fig. 4 Frequency of voids for various sizes $\langle V_v \rangle$ and relative shape anisotropy RSA. Plots are shown across four quench rates (columns) and across five ENB fractions (rows).

factors across quench rates, with a stronger mismatch occurring for slower quenches where the free volume is relatively low.

These differences can be attributed in part to the differing structure of the free volume, as measured by the geometry of voids. An analysis of the void volumes and their relative shape anisotropy (RSA) is shown in Fig. 4. The histogram shows that many small voids have a spherical-like character, and particularly so for the densest systems ($\dot{q} = 10^{0} \text{ K s}^{-1}$) where α is near three. However, as the quench rate becomes faster (observed by moving from the bottom to top of each column), the presence of large voids with high asymmetries is greatly increased. Given the shift in the size and shape of voids, its seems unlikely that a fixed value of α can describe the dynamics across quench rates. While the quench rates used here are not experimentally viable, the results can be interpreted more generally as an instance of glass processing that adds free volume to the structure. This result suggests that measures of the free volume do have the potential to represent glass dynamics for limited ranges of compositions like those in many systematic studies, however the predictive power is lost if the similar structure of the free volume is broken by changes in processing conditions. Further, the results here clearly demonstrate that molecular simulations of the same glass composition can capture a wide range of meta-stable structures, each with differing dynamics, and each with differing trends in the dynamics as the composition is altered. Thus, going forward, a clear understanding of packing and its relationship with dynamical properties is needed if molecular simulations are to take a more predictive role in materials design.

Conflicts of interest

There are no conflicts to declare.

Acknowledgements

The U.S. Government is authorized to reproduce and distribute reprints for government purposes notwithstanding any

copyright notation hereon. A. K. acknowledges financial assistance from the U.S. Department of Commerce, National Institute of Standards and Technology (Award 70NANB15H272).

Notes and references

§ Specifically, a small number of voxels have the potential to belong to more than one cluster. Because voxels are assigned to the earliest cluster that can claim them, the particular order of voxel assignments occasionally causes clusters, some of which would have been near the minimum size of 260 voxels, to lose a small number of voxels to competing clusters.

- 1 R. M. Elder, D. B. Knorr, J. W. Andzelm, J. L. Lenhart and T. W. Sirk, *Soft Matter*, 2016, **12**, 4418–4434.
- 2 R. M. Elder, T. R. Long, E. D. Bain, J. L. Lenhart and T. W. Sirk, *Soft Matter*, 2018, **14**, 8895–8911.
- 3 Y. Qiu, L. W. Antony, J. M. Torkelson, J. J. De Pablo and M. Ediger, *J. Chem. Phys.*, 2018, **149**, 204503.
- 4 K. M. Salerno, J. L. Lenhart, J. J. de Pablo and T. W. Sirk, J. Phys. Chem. B, 2020, **124**, 6112–6120.
- 5 J. M. Dennis, T. R. Long, A. Krishnamurthy, N. T. Tran, B. A. Patterson, C. E. Busch, K. A. Masser, J. L. Lenhart and D. B. Knorr Jr, ACS Appl. Polym. Mater., 2020, 2, 2414–2425.
- 6 C. L. Soles, F. T. Chang, B. A. Bolan, H. A. Hristov,
 D. W. Gidley and A. F. Yee, *J. Polym. Sci., Part B: Polym. Phys.*, 1998, 36, 3035–3048.
- 7 M. Eldrup, D. Lightbody and J. N. Sherwood, *Chem. Phys.*, 1981, **63**, 51–58.
- 8 A. Krishnamurthy, R. Tao, E. Senses, S. M. Doshi, F. A. Burni, B. Natarajan, D. Hunston, E. T. Thostenson, A. Faraone and A. L. Forster, *et al.*, *ACS Appl. Polym. Mater.*, 2019, **1**, 1905–1917.
- 9 T. Kajitani, K. Shibata, S. Ikeda, M. Kohgi, H. Yoshizawa, K. Nemoto and K. Suzuki, *Phys. B: Condens. Matter*, 1995, **213**, 872–874.
- 10 M. Ester, H.-P. Kriegel, J. Sander and X. Xu, *Proceedings of the Second International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining*, 1996, pp. 226–231.
- F. Pedregosa, G. Varoquaux, A. Gramfort, V. Michel, B. Thirion, O. Grisel, M. Blondel, P. Prettenhofer, R. Weiss, V. Dubourg, J. Vanderplas, A. Passos, D. Cournapeau, M. Brucher, M. Perrot and E. Duchesnay, *J. Mach. Learn. Res.*, 2011, **12**, 2825–2830.
- 12 D. Racko, R. Chelli, G. Cardini, S. Califano and J. Bartoš, *Theor. Chem. Acc.*, 2007, **118**, 443–448.
- 13 L. Larini, A. Ottochian, C. De Michele and D. Leporini, *Nat. Phys.*, 2007, 4, 42.
- 14 B. A. Pazmiño Betancourt, P. Z. Hanakata, F. W. Starr and J. F. Douglas, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.*, 2015, **112**, 2966.
- 15 D. M. Saylor, S. Jawahery, J. S. Silverstein and C. Forrey, J. Chem. Phys., 2016, 145, 031106.
- 16 L. Li and A. F. Yee, Macromolecules, 2003, 36, 2793-2801.
- 17 J. Liu and A. F. Yee, Macromolecules, 2000, 33, 1338-1344.
- 18 C. L. Soles, A. B. Burns, K. Ito, E. Chan, J. Liu, A. F. Yee and M. S. Tyagi, *Macromolecules*, 2020, 53, 6672–6681.
- 19 C. L. Soles, A. B. Burns, K. Ito, E. P. Chan, J. F. Douglas, J. Wu, A. F. Yee, Y.-T. Shih, L. Huang and R. M. Dimeo, *et al.*, *Macromolecules*, 2021, 54, 2518–2528.
- 20 L. A. Gray and C. B. Roth, Soft Matter, 2014, 10, 1572-1578.

- 21 A. N. Raegen, J. Yin, Q. Zhou and J. A. Forrest, *Nat. Mater.*, 2020, 1–4.
- 22 Y. Guo, A. Morozov, D. Schneider, J. W. Chung, C. Zhang, M. Waldmann, N. Yao, G. Fytas, C. B. Arnold and R. D. Priestley, *Nat. Mater.*, 2012, 11, 337–343.
- 23 D. Turnbull and M. H. Cohen, J. Chem. Phys., 1961, 34, 120-125.
- 24 R. W. Hall and P. G. Wolynes, J. Chem. Phys., 1987, 86, 2943-2948.
- 25 F. W. Starr, S. Sastry, J. F. Douglas and S. C. Glotzer, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2002, **89**, 125501.
- 26 D. S. Simmons, M. T. Cicerone, Q. Zhong, M. Tyagi and J. F. Douglas, *Soft Matter*, 2012, 8, 11455–11461.