# Intercomparison of NIST, NPL, PTB, and VSL Thermal Voltage Converters from 100 kHz to 1 MHz

J. R. Kinard, R. B. D. Knight, P. Martin, M. Klonz, J. P. M. de Vreede, and J. Dessens

Abstract—Coaxial, thermal voltage converters were handcarried among NIST, NPL, PTB, and VSL for intercomparison of ac-dc difference from 100 kHz to 1 MHz. This paper briefly describes the highly varied methods and underlying principles on which ac-dc difference determinations are based in each laboratory, the transport standards used, and the results of the intercomparisons. The ac-dc differences reported by the participating laboratories are in very good agreement. It has been concluded that representative values of ac-dc difference in the 100 kHz to 1 MHz frequency range have been established with  $2\sigma$  uncertainties of 4–8 ppm.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

THERMAL voltage converters form the primary and working standards at the four participating laboratories for ac-dc difference, and hence ac voltage, in the 100 kHz to 1 MHz frequency range. Coaxial, thermal voltage converters (TVC's) were hand-carried among NIST, NPL, PTB, and VSL during 1989 and 1990. An intercomparison of the ac-dc differences of TVC's in this frequency range is particularly informative because the methods and hardware used by the four laboratories differ significantly. The good agreements among the highly varied methods add considerable additional confidence to the process. NIST acted as the pilot laboratory for this intercomparison.

#### II. METHODS OF INDIVIDUAL LABORATORIES

# A. National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST)

A group of multijunction thermal converters (MJTC's) has been established as the NIST primary standards for ac-dc difference. For these MJTC's constructed with bifilar heaters, thermoelectric and other errors have been shown theoretically and experimentally to be below the

IEEE Log Number 9206481.

0.5 ppm level in the range 30 Hz to 10 kHz from 2 V to 10 V [1]. The fact that these MJTC's were the result of various fabrication techniques over some period of years, significantly improves the confidence in this group.

The extension of the frequency range from 10 kHz up to 1 MHz was achieved using two techniques employing several TVC's containing cylindrical, deposited-carbon resistors mounted coaxially with 5 or 10 mA thermoelements [2]. Firstly, 5–25-V TVC's were made with geometries and electrical characteristics expected to have nearly zero residual reactance and to be nearly frequency independent up to 1 MHz. Intercomparisons of nearly identical structures with different range resistors demonstrated frequency flatness of  $\pm 5$  ppm out to 100 kHz and of  $\pm 10$  ppm out to 1 MHz.

Secondly, the major ac-dc difference contributions from each structural element or region of TVC's similar to those described above were theoretically and experimentally analyzed up to 100 MHz. These contributions were: voltage standing-wave in the input connector, transimpedance of the series resistor, current standing-wave in the thermoelement, and skin effect. Examination of both range dependent and range independent contributions confirmed ac-dc differences at 1 MHz to be < 10 ppm. The comparator systems used at NIST for the measurement of TVC's are described in [1] and [3].

# B. National Physical Laboratory, (NPL)

The foundation of all ac-dc transfer measurements at NPL is a collection of MJTC's [4] obtained from a variety of sources. Single-junction thermal converters (SJTC's) are selected and calibrated in the current mode by comparison with an appropriate MJTC in the mid-frequency range where the errors in MJTC's are known to be small. The errors introduced by extrapolating the response of the SJTC up to 1 MHz are estimated and form a major contribution to the uncertainty of the measurements. Calculations of the parasitic inductive and capacitive properties of 1-k $\Omega$  metal film resistors mounted in relatively large cylindrical enclosures show that these effects produce negligible errors, even at 1 MHz. Various versions of suitable structures have been described, [5], [6], and are widely used for transfer measurements. The combination of such a resistor with a 5-mA or 10-mA SJTC provides a transfer standard rated at 5 or 10 V.

Manuscript received June 12, 1992; revised September 21, 1992.

J. R. Kinard is with the National Institute of Standards and Technology, Electronic and Electrical Engineering Laboratory, U.S. Dept. of Commerce, Technology Administration, Gaithersburg, MD.

R. B. D. Knight and P. Martin, are with the National Physical Laboratory, Teddington, UK.

M. Klonz is with the Physikalisch-Technische Bundesanstalt, Braunschweig, Germany.

J. P. M. de Vreede and J. Dessens are with the Van Swinden Laboratory, Delft, the Netherlands.

Comparison of standard and test items is carried out using a highly automated digital system which models the operation of an analog bridge [7]. The two signal outputs are amplified and digitized by high resolution DMM's. Sequences of 13 measurements are collected with the signal being switched between ac and dc sources in accordance with a specific pattern. Arithmetical manipulation of the data allows the results to be largely independent of drifts in the devices and supplies.

# C. Physikalisch-Technische Bundesanstalt (PTB)

At the PTB, multijunction thermal converters have been developed as basic standards for ac-dc voltage transfer over the entire frequency range from 10 Hz to 1 MHz [8]– [10]. Transfer differences caused by thermoelectric effects, which are present to some degree in nearly all thermal converters, as well as frequency-dependent transfer differences in the audio-frequency range, are negligible in the PTB MJTC's. At higher frequencies, the frequencydependent change of the input impedance of the heater circuit is responsible for ac-dc differences.

The contribution to ac-dc difference due to the bifilar heater, the intermediate leads, and the coaxial connector up to the reference plane of the tee connector have been taken into consideration. The heater resistance with its residual inductance, capacitance, and dielectric losses; the intermediate leads with residual impedance, skin effect, and proximity effect; and the connector circuit with resistance, skin effect, and dielectric losses have been measured or estimated, and the transfer differences calculated for different heater resistances. As an experimental check, the differences among the various MJTC's have been measured. Good agreement between calculated and measured differences was obtained which gives considerable confidence to the correctness of the method.

For frequencies up to 100 kHz, a 190- $\Omega$  MJTC (2.3 V) was chosen as a reference standard. For this resistance, the effect of residual capacitances and dielectric losses are compensated by inductance, skin and proximity effects within the MJTC. The connector contribution is left, and it was measured using a MJTC as a reference with its connection pins placed directly at the reference plane of the tee connector.

As the skin effect increases with frequency squared, such a MJTC has a transfer difference of 92 ppm at 1 MHz. Therefore a MJTC with higher heater resistance is preferred, and a 700- $\Omega$  MJTC (5.6 V) is used as a reference standard. For higher voltages, series resistors and 190- $\Omega$  MJTC's are combined and characterized in a step-up procedure.

#### D. Van Swinden Laboratory (VSL)

In the VSL, the ac-dc difference standards between 100 kHz and 1 MHz have been developed based on calculable HF ac-dc standards which are useful up to 30 MHz [11]. Recently a new set of standards was constructed with smaller ac-dc differences above 1 MHz [12]. Up to 100 kHz a set of multijunction thermal converters of PTB design and mounted in VSL-built housings are used as references [9]. These converters are considered to be nearly independent of frequency up to 100 kHz. The calculable converters and the PTB MJTC's have been compared to confirm the validity of a number of assumptions in the calculation for low frequencies. Within the combined uncertainties, both types of converters give the same results up to 100 kHz.

As standards for this intercomparison, one MJTC, two old style HF TVC's, and one new HF TVC were used. All of the standards were provided with type-N male connectors and the plane of reference for all the VSL measurements was the symmetry plane of a type-N tee connector. The measurement system was an updated version of the VSL system described in [13]. In the updated system the individual thermal converter outputs are amplified by a factor of 100 and any difference is amplified by 500. The overall VSL uncertainty is estimated on the basis of the above mentioned analyses and internal comparisons of 2–4-V TVC's in the range 100 kHz to 1 MHz.

### III. TRANSPORT STANDARDS

The transport standards used in this intercomparison were TVC's of three basic types. The first type consisted of two 5-V and one 10-V commercially manufactured, coaxial TVC's. They contained UHF-pattern thermoelements, internal shield structures, and conventional series resistors and were supplied by NIST. The second type of transport standard was a VSL-constructed and supplied coaxial, 4-V TVC containing a UHF-pattern thermoelement with a thin, straight wire for the series resistor [11]. The third type was a PTB-constructed and supplied MJTC with a 700- $\Omega$ , bifilar heater [9]. The commercial TVC's and the PTB MJTC were mounted with type-874 connectors. The VSL TVC had a type-N connector. The results include values for all three types of TVC's. All measurements were referenced to the center of a type-874 tee structure.

#### **IV. RESULTS**

Since not all of transport TVC's were measured by each of the participating laboratories, a scheme was devised to normalize the results and permit direct intercomparisons of the maximum amount of data. At a particular frequency, the reported values,  $R_x^n$ , of ac-dc difference for an individual TVC, indicated by x, from the various laboratories, indicated by n, were averaged to produce an average result for each TVC

$$\overline{R_x^n} = \frac{\sum\limits_{n}^{n} R_x^n}{n}.$$
 (1)

The deviations,  $D_x^n$ , from those averages were calculated

$$D_x^n = R_x^n - \overline{R_x^n} \tag{2}$$



Fig. 1. Results of intercomparisons with the overall averages indicated as zero ac-dc difference in ppm. Uncertainty bars represent  $\pm 2\sigma$  confidence limits. See results section for details of data analysis.

 TABLE I

 Summary of AC-DC Difference Intercomparisons (ppm)

	100 kHz	200 kHz	500 kHz	1 MHz
Representative Average				
Value				
NIST	-0.2	+1.3	+0.3	+1.6
NPL	-1.3	-2.4	-2.0	+0.6
PTB	-0.1	-0.9	-2.3	-4.6
VSL	+3.0	+4.2	+5.9	+2.5
2σ Uncertainties				
NIST	4	6	10	26
NPL	7	7	14	25
PTB	2	4	8	20
VSL	10	10	14	40
Number of Points				
Contributed				
NIST	3	1	3	3
NPL	2	3	3	3
PTB	4	3	3	3
VSL	1	2	2	3
Standard Deviation of				
Average Values	1.8	2.9	3.8	3.2
Span of Average Values	4.3	6.6	8.2	7.1

and themselves averaged over the TVC's

$$\overline{D_x^n} = \frac{\sum D_x^n}{x} \tag{3}$$

to produce a representative value for each laboratory at each frequency. The representative values,  $\overline{D_x^n}$ , with the respective uncertainties for each laboratory are given in

Table I and in Fig. 1. Also given in Table I are the standard deviations for the representative values and the spans of the representative values.

It should be noted that these representative values are relative to an average value and do not necessarily indicate departure from any true value.

### V. CONCLUSION

The various methods used by the participating laboratories to determine ac-dc difference in this frequency range are quite different. The good agreements among the results are, therefore, particularly gratifying. Not only does every error bar overlap the average value, but every result was within the individually reported  $1\sigma$  of the average value. Using the average values and their standard deviations, it has been concluded that representative values for ac-dc differences in the frequency range 100 kHz to 1 MHz have been established with  $2\sigma$  uncertainties of 4–8 ppm.

#### REFERENCES

- F. L. Hermach, J. R. Kinard, and J. R. Hastings, "Multijunction thermal converters as the NBS primary ac-dc transfer standards for ac current and voltage measurements," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. Meas.*, vol. IM-36, pp. 300-306, June 1987.
- [2] J. R. Kinard and T. X. Cai, "Determination of ac-dc difference in the 0.1-100 MHz frequency range," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. Meas.*, vol. 38, pp. 360-367, Apr. 1989.
- [3] E. S. Williams and J. R. Kinard, "A dual-channel automated comparator for ac-dc difference measurements," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. Meas.*, vol. IM-34, pp. 290-294, June 1985.
- [4] F. J. Wilkins, T. A. Deacon, and R. S. Becker, "Multijunction thermal converters," Proc. IEE, vol. 112, pp. 794-805, Apr. 1965.
- [5] F. L. Hermach and E. S. Williams, "Thermal voltage converters for accurate voltage measurements to 30 megacycles per second," *Trans. AIEE (Comm. and Elec.)*, vol. 79, pt. I, pp. 200–206, July 1960.
- [6] P. Martin and R. B. D. Knight, "Components and systems for ac-dc transfer at the ppm level," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. and Meas.*, vol. IM-32, pp. 63-72, Mar. 1983.
- [7] R. B. D. Knight, D. J. Legg, and P. Martin, "Digital 'bridge' for comparison of ac-dc transfer instruments," *Proc. IEE A*, vol. 138, pp. 101-104, Mar. 1991.
- [8] M. Klonz, "Experience with the PTB-multijunction thermal converter as an ac-dc transfer standard," Com. Consult. d'Electricité, 17<sup>e</sup> session Doc. CCE/86-55, 1986.
- [9] M. Klonz, "AC-DC transfer difference of the PTB-multijunction thermal converter in the frequency range from 10 Hz to 100 kHz," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. Meas.*, vol. IM-36, pp. 360–367, June 1987.
- [10] M. Klonz, "AC-DC voltage transfer difference of the PTB-multijunction thermal converter at 1 MHz," in *CPEM'90 Digest*, June 1990, Ottawa, Canada, pp. 60-61.
- [11] M. Nomair and K. J. P. M. Harmans, "High accuracy calculable acdc transfer standards for the LF-30 MHz frequency range," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. and Meas.*, vol. 38, pp. 342-345, Apr. 1989.
- [12] M. Nomair and K. J. P. M. Harmans, "A high accuracy calculable ac-dc transfer standard," VSL Report ES-88-04 (implementation in annex), 1989.
- [13] K. J. P. M. Harmans, J. J. Schmitt, and R. Kaarls, "A high precision automated system for ac-dc transfer using thermal converters," in *Digest Conf. Precision Elec. Meas.* 1982, 1982, pp. D5-D7.



Fig. 1. Results of indecompetitums with the overall generates indicating as seen ac-or difference in point. Uncertainty burs represent 2.26 confidence limits. See results section for details of data studyess.

TABLE | Sundand of ac de Duppellance interconfrantspas (778)

and themselves averaged over the TVC's

$$\overline{D}_{i}^{0} = \frac{\frac{2x}{x}D_{i}}{x}$$
(3)

to produce a representative value for each laboratory at each frequency. The representative values,  $\overline{D}_{12}^{\mu}$ , with the respective uncertainties for each laboratory are given in

Table I and in Fig. 1. Also given in Laole I are the standeed deviations for the representative values and the spans of the representative values.

It should be soled that these representative values are relative to an everage value and do not necessarily lishcate departure from any nuclevalue.

#### A" CONCENSION

The various methods used by the participating laboratories to determine ac-de difference in this frequency range are quite different. The good agreements among the results are, therefore, particularly gratifying. Not only does every error but overlap the average value, but every result was within the individually reported 1n of the average value. Using the average values and their standard deviations, it has been concluded that representative values for ac-de differences in the frequency mage 100 kHz to 1 MHz have been established with 2n uncertainties of 4-8 mm.

#### KELEKRACT?

- [1] F. L. Hermach, J. R. Kimend, and J. R. Hantinga, "Multiplocation thermal converters as the NBS primary ac-do transfer standards for ac nonzmi and voltage measurements," *IEEE Franc. Instrum. Meas.*, vol. 156, 36, pp. 300–306, June 1987.
- [2] I. E. Kinnel and T. X. Czt, "Determination of ac-de-Olference in Eq. 0.1-100 Mills frequency range," *IEEE Trans. Interact. Med.*, and 34 nm 346-367. Apr. 1989.
- [3] E. S. Withinm and J. R. Kapard, "A dash-channel automated comparation for ac de difference montuberecuta," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. Mass. vol.* 104-35 no. 200–209. https://doi.org/1085.
- [4] F. P. Wilkins, T. A. Decom, and R. S. Becker, "Multiplication distunal converses," Proc. IEE, vol. 112, pp. 794–805, Apr. 1965.
- [5] F. L. Bronnech and E. S. Williams, "Thermal voltage converters for accurate voltage measurements to 30 megagycles per accoud," *Trans. Accel. Research and Electronics*, 20 m. J. no. 200, 206, hep-1960.
- [6] P. Martin and R. B. D. Knight, "Components and systems for ac-dc transfer at the ppon level," *IEEE Trans. Instrum. and Menz.*, vol. 106:32, pp. 63–72, Mar. 1983.
- [7] R. B. D. Kaught, D. I. Legg, and P. Nierte, "Digital "orage for comparison of an do transfer maintenents," *Proc. IEE A*, vol. 138, pp. 101–104, Mar. 1991.
- [3] M. KJORJ, Experience with the P.D.-Diumphesion memory converter in an ac-de transfer standard," Cont. Control. d'Electricité, 17" session Dir. CCE/86–55, 1986.
- [9] M. Klonz, "AC-DC transfer difference of the PTB-multiparchon thermal converser in the irrepresey range from 10 Hz to 100 EHz."
- [10] M. Kleun, "AC-DC voltage transfer difference of the PTB-molifiunction thermal converter at 3 MHz," in CPEM'90 Digest, June
- [11] M. Nomair and K. J. P. M. Harmens, "High necaratey calculable ac do transfer standards for the LP-30 MHz frequency range," IEEE 1980.
- [12] M. Nomair and K. J. P. M. Harmani, "A high accuracy calculable ac-de transfer standard," VSL Report ES-88-04 (implementation in second 1980.
- [13] K. J. P. M. Harmons, J. J. Schmitt, and R. Kaarin, "A high practition automated system for no-dc transfer using thermal converters," in Digest Conf. Provision Elec. Mean. 1982, 1982, pp. D5-D7.